



Harmonic analysis

# Failure of the Hörmander kernel condition for multilinear Calderón–Zygmund operators <sup>☆</sup>

*Insuffisance de la condition de noyau de Hörmander pour les opérateurs multilinéaires de Calderón–Zygmund*

Loukas Grafakos <sup>a</sup>, Danqing He <sup>b</sup>, Lenka Slavíková <sup>a</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Mathematics, University of Missouri, Columbia MO 65211, USA

<sup>b</sup> Department of Mathematics Sun Yat-sen (Zhongshan) University, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article history:

Received 10 December 2018

Accepted 5 April 2019

Available online 19 April 2019

Presented by Yves Meyer

## ABSTRACT

It is well known that the Hörmander smoothness condition  $\sup_{y \neq 0} \int_{|x| \geq 2|y|} |K(x-y) - K(x)| dx < \infty$  implies weak-type  $(1, 1)$  estimates for associated  $L^2$ -bounded Calderón–Zygmund operators. It has been an open question to know whether Hörmander’s condition also suffices to guarantee weak-type  $(1, 1, 1/2)$  estimates for bilinear Calderón–Zygmund operators that are bounded at one point. In this paper, we provide a negative answer to this question.

© 2019 Académie des sciences. Published by Elsevier Masson SAS. All rights reserved.

## R É S U M É

Il est bien connu que la condition de lissage de Hörmander  $\sup_{y \neq 0} \int_{|x| \geq 2|y|} |K(x-y) - K(x)| dx < \infty$  implique des estimations faibles de type  $(1, 1)$  pour les opérateurs de Calderón–Zygmund  $L^2$ -bornés. La question s’est alors posée de savoir si cette condition de Hörmander est également suffisante pour assurer des estimations faibles de type  $(1, 1, 1/2)$  pour les opérateurs bilinéaires de Calderón–Zygmund qui sont bornés en un point. Nous donnons ici une réponse négative à cette question.

© 2019 Académie des sciences. Published by Elsevier Masson SAS. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

Hörmander’s [12] adaptation of the Calderón–Zygmund theorem says that an  $L^2$ -bounded convolution operator associated with a kernel  $K$  on  $\mathbb{R}^d$  satisfying the smoothness condition

<sup>☆</sup> The first author was supported by the Simons Foundation (No. 315380). The second author was supported by the NNSF of China (No. 11701583), the Guangdong Natural Science Foundation (No. 2017A030310054) and the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (No. 17lpgy11).

E-mail addresses: grafakos@missouri.edu (L. Grafakos), hedanqing@mail.sysu.edu.cn (D. He), slavikoval@missouri.edu (L. Slavíková).

$$\|K\|_H = \sup_{y \neq 0} \int_{|x| \geq 2|y|} |K(x-y) - K(x)| dx < \infty \tag{1}$$

is also bounded from  $L^1(\mathbb{R}^d)$  to  $L^{1,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)$ . By duality and interpolation, this classical result implies that the operator also admits an  $L^p$ -bounded extension for all  $p \in (1, \infty)$ . Recent interest in multilinear extensions of the Calderón–Zygmund theory has led to the development of multilinear harmonic analysis; see [7, Chapter 7] and [17]. This area was introduced by Coifman and Meyer in their seminal work [3], [4], [5]. A fundamental result in this theory is that, if an  $m$ -linear Calderón–Zygmund operator is bounded from  $L^2 \times \dots \times L^2$  to  $L^{2/m}$  and its kernel  $K$  satisfies an appropriate size condition and a standard Lipschitz smoothness condition on  $\mathbb{R}^{md}$ , then it is bounded from  $L^1 \times \dots \times L^1$  to  $L^{1/m,\infty}$ ; this result implies strong boundedness for the operator from the product of Lebesgue spaces to another Lebesgue space  $L^p$  in the largest range of indices possible, and also implies weak-type boundedness at the endpoints. Boundedness in the region where the target space is  $L^p$  with  $p > 1$  was first proved by Coifman and Meyer [4], [5], and was extended to the case  $p \leq 1$  by Kenig and Stein [13], and independently by Grafakos and Torres [11]. A natural question, inspired by linear theory, is whether this result also holds if the kernel  $K$ , which is a function on  $\mathbb{R}^{md} \setminus \{0\}$ , satisfies only Hörmander’s condition (1). This question has been around since 2002 and has attracted some attention. In this note, we provide a negative answer to it. Our argument is mainly inspired by two ingredients related to bilinear rough singular integrals. The first one is a reinforced and quantitative version of the counterexample in [6], while the second one is the  $L^2 \times L^2 \rightarrow L^1$  boundedness of bilinear rough singular integrals recently obtained in [8] and [9].

Our counterexample is a homogeneous kernel, i.e. a kernel that has the form:

$$K_\Omega(x_1, x_2) = \Omega((x_1, x_2)/|(x_1, x_2)|)|x_1, x_2|^{-2d}, \quad (x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^{2d}$$

where  $\Omega$  is integrable on the sphere  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$  with vanishing integral. The associated bilinear Calderón–Zygmund operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is then defined as

$$T_{K_\Omega}(f, g)(x) = \text{p.v.} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{2d}} K_\Omega(x - y_1, x - y_2) f(y_1) g(y_2) dy_1 dy_2.$$

We prove the following result:

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $1 \leq q < \infty$ . There exists an odd function  $\Omega$  in  $L^q(\mathbb{S}^{2d-1})$  such that the associated kernel  $K_\Omega$  satisfies the Hörmander kernel condition (1), but the associated bilinear Calderón–Zygmund operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  does not map  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  whenever  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$ ,  $1 \leq p_1, p_2 \leq \infty$  and  $\frac{1}{p} + \frac{2d-1}{q} > 2d$ . In particular, this operator is not of weak type  $(1, 1, \frac{1}{2})$  when  $1 \leq q < \frac{2d-1}{2d-2}$ .*

If  $\Omega \in L^q(\mathbb{S}^{2d-1})$  with  $q \geq 2$ , then  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is always  $L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^1(\mathbb{R}^d)$  bounded, see [8]; this result was later extended to  $\frac{4}{3} < q \leq \infty$  in [9]. Thus Theorem 1 yields the following corollary:

**Corollary 2.** *Let  $d \in \{1, 2\}$ . There exists an odd function  $\Omega$  on  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$  such that  $K_\Omega$  satisfies Hörmander’s condition (1) and the associated operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is bounded from  $L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^1(\mathbb{R}^d)$ , but is unbounded from  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  to  $L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  whenever  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$ ,  $1 \leq p_1, p_2 \leq \infty$  and  $p < \frac{4}{2d+3}$ . In particular, this operator is not of weak type  $(1, 1, \frac{1}{2})$ .*

**Remark 1.** To obtain, via these techniques, an example of an  $L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^2(\mathbb{R}^d)$  to  $L^1(\mathbb{R}^d)$  bounded bilinear Calderón–Zygmund operator whose kernel satisfies Hörmander’s condition (1) but which does not satisfy a weak-type  $(1, 1, \frac{1}{2})$  estimate in an arbitrary dimension  $d$ , we would need to know that

$$\|T_{K_\Omega}\|_{L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^1(\mathbb{R}^d)} \leq C \|\Omega\|_{L^q(\mathbb{S}^{2d-1})} \tag{2}$$

for all  $q > 1$ ; but (2) remains open, as of this writing, for  $1 < q \leq \frac{4}{3}$ .

Other versions of the Hörmander kernel condition in the multilinear setting are given in [16], [15] and [2]; these conditions are weaker than (1), so our example applies also in that case. Our result should be contrasted with the positive result in [18] concerning a stronger geometric version of condition (1).

Additionally, it was observed in [11] that, if  $\Omega \in L^1(\mathbb{R})$  is an odd function, then the boundedness of  $T_{K_\Omega}$  can be obtained as a consequence of the uniform boundedness of the bilinear Hilbert transforms, see [10], [14]. Thus, in particular,  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is bounded from  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R})$  to  $L^p(\mathbb{R})$  whenever the triple  $(\frac{1}{p_1}, \frac{1}{p_2}, \frac{1}{p})$  belongs to the hexagon  $\mathcal{H}$  defined by the relations  $1 < p_1, p_2, p < \infty$ ,  $\frac{1}{p_2} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$  and

$$\left| \frac{1}{p_1} - \frac{1}{p_2} \right| < \frac{1}{2}, \quad \left| \frac{1}{p_1} - \frac{1}{p'} \right| < \frac{1}{2}, \quad \left| \frac{1}{p_2} - \frac{1}{p'} \right| < \frac{1}{2},$$

where  $p' = \frac{p}{p-1}$ . We note that this hexagon contains points  $(\frac{1}{p_1}, \frac{1}{p_2}, \frac{1}{p})$  with  $p > 1$  arbitrarily close to 1. Another corollary of Theorem 1 is the following.

**Corollary 3.** *There exists an odd function  $\Omega$  on  $\mathbb{S}^1$  such that the kernel  $K_\Omega$  satisfies the 2-dimensional Hörmander condition (1) and the associated operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is bounded from  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R})$  to  $L^p(\mathbb{R})$  whenever  $(\frac{1}{p_1}, \frac{1}{p_2}, \frac{1}{p}) \in \mathcal{H}$ , but does not map  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R})$  to  $L^p(\mathbb{R})$  if  $0 < p < 1$ ,  $1 \leq p_1, p_2 \leq \infty$  and  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$ .*

For clarity, we prove the one-dimensional version of Theorem 1 in the next section. The proof in the  $d$ -dimensional case is given in Section 3; this contains an additional perturbation argument. We verify that  $K_\Omega$  satisfies (1) in Section 4. In Section 5, we briefly discuss the multilinear situation. The notations  $A \gtrsim B$  and  $A \lesssim B$  mean that  $A \geq cB$  and  $A \leq cB$ , where  $c$  is an inessential constant, while  $A \sim B$  means both  $A \gtrsim B$  and  $A \lesssim B$ .

**2. Proof of Theorem 1 when  $d = 1$**

Define points on the circle  $\mathbb{S}^1$

$$a_n = \left( \cos\left(\frac{\pi}{4} + \frac{\pi}{2^n}\right), \sin\left(\frac{\pi}{4} + \frac{\pi}{2^n}\right) \right)$$

and define circular arcs  $I_n^+$  with endpoints  $a_n$  and  $a_{n+1}$  for  $n = 10, 11, 12, \dots$ . Let  $I_n^-$  be the reflection about the origin of  $I_n^+$ . We observe that the length  $\ell_n$  of both  $I_n^+$  and  $I_n^-$  is approximately  $2^{-n}$ . Consider the function

$$\Omega = \sum_{n=10}^{\infty} h_n (\chi_{I_n^+} - \chi_{I_n^-})$$

where  $h_n = 2^{n\delta}$  for some  $\delta < 1/q$ . Note that

$$\|\Omega\|_{L^q(\mathbb{S}^1)} \leq c \left( \sum_{n=10}^{\infty} h_n^q \ell_n \right)^{\frac{1}{q}} \leq c \left( \sum_{n=10}^{\infty} 2^{n\delta q - n} \right)^{\frac{1}{q}} < \infty$$

and that  $\Omega$  is an odd function on  $\mathbb{S}^1$ .

For  $0 < \varepsilon < \frac{1}{100}$ , define  $f_\varepsilon = (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{1}{p_1}} \chi_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]}$ ,  $g_\varepsilon = (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{1}{p_2}} \chi_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]}$ ; these functions satisfy  $\|f_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_1}} = \|g_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_2}} = 1$ .

Let us fix an  $x \in \mathbb{R}$  such that  $\frac{11}{10} \leq x \leq \frac{12}{10}$ . Then we have

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \geq (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{1}{p_1}} (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{1}{p_2}} \int_{|y_1| < \varepsilon} \int_{|y_2| < \varepsilon} \frac{\Omega\left(\frac{(x-y_1, x-y_2)}{|(x-y_1, x-y_2)|}\right)}{|(x-y_1, x-y_2)|^2} dy_1 dy_2. \tag{3}$$

Let  $P_{\varepsilon, x}$  be all projections of points of the form  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)$  onto the circle  $\mathbb{S}^1$ , where  $(y_1, y_2)$  is an arbitrary point in  $(-\varepsilon, \varepsilon) \times (-\varepsilon, \varepsilon)$ . As the point  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)$  lies near the positive diagonal (that forms  $45^\circ$  with the positive horizontal axis), this projection will only intersect circular caps  $I_n^+$  and will never intersect caps  $I_n^-$ . In this case, every term in the sum that defines  $\Omega$  and appears in (3) is positive. We obtain

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \geq c\varepsilon^{-\frac{1}{p_1}} \varepsilon^{-\frac{1}{p_2}} \varepsilon \sum_{\substack{n \geq 10 \\ I_n^+ \subseteq P_{\varepsilon, x}}} \ell_n h_n$$

as  $|(x - y_1, x - y_2)|^2 \sim 1$  and if  $I_n^+ \subseteq P_{\varepsilon, x}$ , then the set of those  $(y_1, y_2)$  satisfying  $|y_1| < \varepsilon$ ,  $|y_2| < \varepsilon$  and  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)/|(x - y_1, x - y_2)| \in I_n^+$  has measure comparable to  $\varepsilon \ell_n$ , since  $x$  is so close to 1. As  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$ , we obtain, for  $\frac{11}{10} \leq x \leq \frac{12}{10}$ , that

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \gtrsim \varepsilon^{-\frac{1}{p}+1} \sum_{\substack{n: \\ 2^{-n} < c\varepsilon}} 2^{n\delta-n} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{2-\frac{1}{p}-\delta},$$

which yields that  $\|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)\|_{L^{p, \infty}(\mathbb{R})} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{2-\frac{1}{p}-\delta}$ , and

$$\|T_{K_\Omega}\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow L^{p, \infty}(\mathbb{R})} \geq \frac{\|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)\|_{L^{p, \infty}(\mathbb{R})}}{\|f_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R})} \|g_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R})}} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{2-\frac{1}{p}-\delta}.$$

Choosing  $\delta$  sufficiently close to  $1/q$ , we conclude that, if  $2 - \frac{1}{p} - \frac{1}{q} < 0$ , then

$$\|T_{K_\Omega}\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R})} = \infty.$$

To complete the proof of the main theorem, we need to know that  $K_\Omega$  satisfies Hörmander's condition (1). For this, we prove the following lemma in which points in  $\mathbb{R}^2$  will be denoted by capital letters.

**Lemma 4.** *Let  $r > 1$  and  $\Omega_t = t^{-\frac{1}{r}} \chi_{I_t}$ , where  $I_t$  is a circular arc of small length  $t > 0$  on the circle  $\mathbb{S}^1$ . Then there is a constant  $C_r < \infty$  such that*

$$\sup_{t>0} \sup_{Y \neq 0} \int_{|X| \geq 2|Y|} |K_{\Omega_t}(X - Y) - K_{\Omega_t}(X)| \, dX \leq C_r.$$

As the proof of Lemma 4 is contained in that of Lemma 5 proved later, we do not include it here. Since  $\delta < \frac{1}{q} \leq 1$ , we can choose  $r$  such that  $\delta < \frac{1}{r} < 1$ , then Lemma 4 gives that

$$\begin{aligned} \|K_\Omega\|_H &\leq \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n \ell_n^{\frac{1}{r}} \left( \left\| \frac{1}{\ell_n^{\frac{1}{r}}} \chi_{I_n^+} \right\|_H + \left\| \frac{1}{\ell_n^{\frac{1}{r}}} \chi_{I_n^-} \right\|_H \right) \\ &\leq C \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n \ell_n^{\frac{1}{r}} = C \sum_{n=10}^\infty 2^{n\delta - n\frac{1}{r}} \end{aligned}$$

and this sum is convergent. This concludes the proof of Theorem 1 when  $d = 1$ .

### 3. Proof of Theorem 1 when $d \geq 2$

We now extend the proof to higher dimensions. Fix a point

$$a = \left( \frac{1}{\sqrt{2d}}, \dots, \frac{1}{\sqrt{2d}} \right) \in \mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$$

and for  $n = 10, 11, 12, \dots$  define spherical annuli

$$A_n^+ = \mathbb{S}^{2d-1} \cap \left( B(a, 2^{-n}) \setminus B(a, 2^{-n-1}) \right).$$

Let  $A_n^-$  be the reflection about the origin of  $A_n^+$ . We observe that the measure  $\nu_n$  of both  $A_n^+$  and  $A_n^-$  is approximately  $2^{-n(2d-1)}$ . Consider the function

$$\Omega = \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n (\chi_{A_n^+} - \chi_{A_n^-})$$

where  $h_n = 2^{n\delta}$  for some  $\delta < \frac{2d-1}{q}$ . Note that

$$\|\Omega\|_{L^q(\mathbb{S}^{2d-1})} \leq c \left( \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n^q \nu_n \right)^{\frac{1}{q}} \leq c \left( \sum_{n=10}^\infty 2^{n(\delta q - (2d-1))} \right)^{\frac{1}{q}} < \infty$$

and that  $\Omega$  is an odd function on  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$ .

For  $0 < \varepsilon < \frac{1}{100d}$ , define  $f_\varepsilon = (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{d}{p_1}} \chi_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^d}$ ,  $g_\varepsilon = (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{d}{p_2}} \chi_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^d}$ ; these functions satisfy  $\|f_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_1}} = \|g_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_2}} = 1$ .

Let us fix an interval on the diagonal line in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  defined by

$$I_d = \left\{ x \in \mathbb{R}^d : x_1 = x_2 = \dots = x_d \in \left[ \frac{1}{\sqrt{d}} + \frac{1}{100d}, \frac{1}{\sqrt{d}} + \frac{2}{100d} \right] \right\}. \tag{4}$$

Then, for  $x \in I_d$ , we have

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \geq (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{d}{p_1}} (2\varepsilon)^{-\frac{d}{p_2}} \int_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^d} \int_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^d} \frac{\Omega\left(\frac{(x-y_1, x-y_2)}{|(x-y_1, x-y_2)|}\right)}{|(x-y_1, x-y_2)|^2} \, dy_1 \, dy_2. \tag{5}$$

Let  $P_{\varepsilon, x}$  be the set of all projections onto the sphere  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$  of points of the form  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)$ , where  $(y_1, y_2)$  is an arbitrary point in  $[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^{2d}$ . As the point  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)$  lies near the positive diagonal, this projection will only intersect spherical annuli  $A_n^+$  and will never intersect annuli  $A_n^-$ . In this case, every term in the sum that defines  $\Omega$  and appears in (5) is positive. We obtain

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \geq c\varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p_1}} \varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p_2}} \varepsilon \sum_{\substack{n \geq 10 \\ A_n^+ \subseteq P_{\varepsilon,x}}} v_n h_n$$

as  $|(x - y_1, x - y_2)|^2 \sim 1$  and if  $A_n^+ \subseteq P_{\varepsilon,x}$ , then the set of those  $(y_1, y_2)$  satisfying  $(y_1, y_2) \in [-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^{2d}$  and  $(x - y_1, x - y_2)/|(x - y_1, x - y_2)| \in A_n^+$  has measure comparable to  $\varepsilon v_n$ , since  $x$  is so close to the unit sphere. Since  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \frac{1}{p_2} = \frac{1}{p}$ , we obtain

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \gtrsim \varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p}+1} \sum_{\substack{n: \\ 2^{-n} < c_d \varepsilon}} 2^{n\delta - n(2d-1)} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{(2-\frac{1}{p})d - \delta},$$

whenever  $x \in I_d$ . In particular, in the last summation the term with  $2^{-n_\varepsilon} \sim \frac{c_d}{10}\varepsilon$  would contribute essentially the same lower bound  $\varepsilon^{(2-\frac{1}{p})d - \delta}$ .

We now fix a point  $x_0 \in I_d$ . For any  $x$  such that  $|x - x_0| \leq c'_d \varepsilon$  with  $c'_d$  a small positive constant, we define  $P_{\varepsilon,x}$  as the projection of  $(x, x) + [-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^{2d}$  onto  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$ . Recalling that  $P_{\varepsilon,x_0}$  contains  $A_{n_\varepsilon}^+$  and that the distance between  $A_{n_\varepsilon}^+$  and  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1} \setminus P_{\varepsilon,x_0}$  is greater than  $\frac{c_d}{2}\varepsilon$ , we obtain that  $A_{n_\varepsilon}^+ \subset P_{\varepsilon,x}$  if  $c'_d$  is small enough, since the distance between the boundary of  $P_{\varepsilon,x_0}$  and the boundary of  $P_{\varepsilon,x}$  is bounded by  $c'_d \varepsilon$ . In summary, for any point  $x \in N_\varepsilon$ , the  $c'_d \varepsilon$ -neighborhood of  $I_d$  with volume about  $\varepsilon^{d-1}$ , we have

$$|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)(x)| \gtrsim \varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p}+1} 2^{n_\varepsilon(\delta-2d+1)} \sim \varepsilon^{(2-\frac{1}{p})d - \delta}. \tag{6}$$

This yields

$$\|T_{K_\Omega}\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)} \geq \frac{\|T_{K_\Omega}(f_\varepsilon, g_\varepsilon)\|_{L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)}}{\|f_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d)} \|g_\varepsilon\|_{L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}^d)}} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{\frac{d-1}{p} + (2-\frac{1}{p})d - \delta}.$$

Choosing  $\delta$  sufficiently close to  $\frac{2d-1}{q}$ , we conclude that, if

$$2d - \frac{1}{p} - \frac{2d-1}{q} < 0,$$

then

$$\|T_{K_\Omega}\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times L^{p_2}(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^{p,\infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)} = \infty.$$

We have the following  $d$ -dimensional extension of Lemma 4.

**Lemma 5.** *Let  $r > \frac{1}{2d-1}$  and  $\Omega_t = t^{-\frac{1}{r}} \chi_{A_t}$ , where  $A_t$  is a spherical cap of small radius  $t$  on the sphere  $\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$ . Then there is a constant  $C$  that depends on  $d$  and  $r$  such that*

$$\sup_{t>0} \sup_{\substack{Y \neq 0 \\ |X| \geq 2|Y|}} \int |K_{\Omega_t}(X - Y) - K_{\Omega_t}(X)| dX \leq C. \tag{7}$$

We note that each spherical annulus  $A_n^+, A_n^-$  can be written as  $B_n^+ \setminus C_n^+$  or  $B_n^- \setminus C_n^-$ , where  $B_n^+, C_n^+$  and  $B_n^-, C_n^-$  are spherical caps of radius approximately  $2^{-n}$  centered at  $a$  and  $-a$ , respectively. Therefore, assuming Lemma 5, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \|K_\Omega\|_H &\leq \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n 2^{-\frac{n}{r}} \left\| 2^{\frac{n}{r}} (\chi_{B_n^+} - \chi_{C_n^+} - \chi_{B_n^-} + \chi_{C_n^-}) \right\|_H \\ &\leq C \sum_{n=10}^\infty h_n 2^{-\frac{n}{r}} = C \sum_{n=10}^\infty 2^{n\delta - \frac{n}{r}} \end{aligned}$$

and this sum is convergent if we choose  $\delta < \frac{1}{r} < 2d - 1$ , which is possible since  $\delta < \frac{2d-1}{q} \leq 2d - 1$ .

This finishes the proof of Theorem 1 for  $d \geq 2$  assuming Lemma 5, which is proved in the next section.

**4. Proof of Lemma 5**

Let  $X \in \mathbb{R}^{2d}$  and  $X' = X/|X|$ . It suffices to prove that

$$\int_{|X| \geq 2|Y|} |\Omega_t((X - Y)') - \Omega_t(X')| \frac{dX}{|X - Y|^{2d}} \leq C < \infty$$

as the part

$$\int_{|X| \geq 2|Y|} \left| \frac{\Omega_t(X')}{|X - Y|^{2d}} - \frac{\Omega_t(X')}{|X|^{2d}} \right| dX$$

is trivially bounded by  $\|\Omega_t\|_{L^1(\mathbb{S}^{2d-1})} \leq C$  since  $r > \frac{1}{2d-1}$ .

But  $|X - Y| \sim |X|$ , and so we look at

$$\int_{2|Y|}^{\infty} \int_{\mathbb{S}^{2d-1}} |\Omega_t((s\theta - Y)') - \Omega_t(\theta)| d\theta \frac{ds}{s}. \tag{8}$$

The interior integral vanishes if both terms  $\chi_{A_t}((s\theta - Y)')$  and  $\chi_{A_t}(\theta)$  are 1 or 0. Thus we may consider the case when one term is one and the other is zero. In this case, we estimate the expression on the left in (7) by

$$t^{-\frac{1}{r}} \int_{2|Y|}^{\infty} |\{\theta \in A_t, (\theta - \frac{Y}{s})' \notin A_t\}| \frac{ds}{s} + t^{-\frac{1}{r}} \int_{2|Y|}^{\infty} |\{\theta \notin A_t, (\theta - \frac{Y}{s})' \in A_t\}| \frac{ds}{s}.$$

Both  $A_t$  and the set of all  $\theta \in \mathbb{S}^{2d-1}$  for which  $(\theta - \frac{Y}{s})' \in A_t$  have spherical measure at most  $ct^{2d-1}$ , where to show the latter we use the fact that  $|\frac{Y}{s}| \leq \frac{1}{2}$ . Let us now assume that  $\frac{|Y|}{s} \leq \frac{t}{100} \ll 1$ . In the first integral, the set has spherical measure at most  $c\frac{|Y|}{s}t^{2d-2}$ , because it is comparable to  $|A'_t \setminus A_t|$  with  $A'_t$  an appropriate rotation of  $A_t$  with displacement  $\sim \frac{|Y|}{s}$ . Similarly, the set in the second integral has spherical measure at most  $c\frac{|Y|}{s}t^{2d-2}$  as well. We therefore obtain the estimate for (8)

$$ct^{-\frac{1}{r}} \left[ \int_{2|Y|}^{\frac{100|Y|}{t}} t^{2d-1} \frac{ds}{s} + \int_{\frac{100|Y|}{t}}^{\infty} \frac{|Y|}{s} t^{2d-2} \frac{ds}{s} \right] \leq ct^{-\frac{1}{r}} [t^{2d-1} \log(t^{-1})] \leq C,$$

where  $C < \infty$ , since  $2d - 1 - \frac{1}{r} > 0$  and  $t \leq 1$ . This proves (7).

### 5. The multilinear case

The argument needed to prove a multilinear version of Theorem 1 is similar to the one performed above. We sketch it below for completeness.

Let  $\Omega$  be an integrable function on the sphere  $\mathbb{S}^{md-1}$  with vanishing integral. We define

$$K_{\Omega}(x_1, \dots, x_m) = \Omega((x_1, \dots, x_m) / |(x_1, \dots, x_m)|) |(x_1, \dots, x_m)|^{-md}$$

for  $(x_1, \dots, x_m) \in \mathbb{R}^{md}$ . The  $m$ -linear rough singular integral operator  $T_{K_{\Omega}}$  is then defined by

$$T_{K_{\Omega}}(f_1, \dots, f_m)(x) = \text{p.v.} \int_{\mathbb{R}^{md}} K_{\Omega}(x - y_1, \dots, x - y_m) f_1(y_1) \cdots f_m(y_m) dy_1 \cdots dy_m.$$

Let  $1 \leq q < \infty$ . We choose  $a = (\frac{1}{\sqrt{md}}, \dots, \frac{1}{\sqrt{md}}) \in \mathbb{S}^{md-1}$ , and define  $\Omega = \sum_n h_n (\chi_{A_n^+} - \chi_{A_n^-})$  with  $h_n = 2^{n\delta}$  and  $\delta < (md - 1)/q$ . Here,  $A_n^+$  is a spherical annulus centered at point  $a$  whose radius is  $2^{-n}$  and measure  $\sim 2^{-(md-1)n}$ , and  $A_n^-$  is its reflection with respect to the origin. We can easily check that  $\Omega \in L^q(\mathbb{S}^{md-1})$ .

Let  $1 \leq p_1, \dots, p_m \leq \infty$  and  $p > 0$  be such that  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \dots + \frac{1}{p_m} = \frac{1}{p}$ . We take  $f_j = (2\varepsilon)^{-d/p_j} \chi_{[-\varepsilon, \varepsilon]^d}$ ; then  $\|f_j\|_{L^{p_j}(\mathbb{R}^d)} = 1$  for  $j = 1, \dots, m$ . Let  $I_d$  be as in (4) and let  $N_{\varepsilon}$  be a  $c'_d \varepsilon$ -neighborhood of  $I_d$ , then we can verify that

$$T_{K_{\Omega}}(f_1, \dots, f_m)(x) \geq c\varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p}} \varepsilon \sum_{n: 2^{-n} \leq \varepsilon} |A_n^+| h_n \sim c\varepsilon^{-\frac{d}{p} + md - \delta}$$

for all  $x \in N_{\varepsilon}$ . Therefore,

$$\|T_{K_{\Omega}}\|_{L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times \dots \times L^{p_m}(\mathbb{R}^d) \rightarrow L^{p, \infty}(\mathbb{R}^d)} \gtrsim \varepsilon^{md - \frac{1}{p} - \delta},$$

which tends to  $\infty$  as  $\varepsilon \rightarrow 0$  when  $md < \frac{1}{p} + \frac{md-1}{q}$  if we choose  $\delta$  close to  $\frac{md-1}{q}$ . It is straightforward to verify Lemma 5 in the multilinear setting under the condition  $r > \frac{1}{md-1}$ . In summary, we have showed the following.

**Proposition 6.** For any  $1 \leq q < \infty$ , there is an odd function  $\Omega$  in  $L^q(\mathbb{S}^{md-1})$  such that the associated kernel  $K_\Omega$  satisfies Hörmander's condition (1) but the Calderón–Zygmund operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  does not map  $L^{p_1}(\mathbb{R}^d) \times \cdots \times L^{p_m}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  to  $L^p(\mathbb{R}^d)$  whenever  $\frac{1}{p_1} + \cdots + \frac{1}{p_m} = \frac{1}{p}$ ,  $1 \leq p_1, \dots, p_m \leq \infty$ , and  $\frac{1}{p} + \frac{md-1}{q} > md$ . In particular, this operator is not of weak type  $(1, \dots, 1, \frac{1}{m})$  when  $1 \leq q < \frac{md-1}{m(d-1)}$ .

**Remark 2.** It is known from [1] that the  $m$ -linear operator  $T_{K_\Omega}$  is bounded from  $L^2(\mathbb{R}^d) \times \cdots \times L^2(\mathbb{R}^d)$  to  $L^{2/m}(\mathbb{R}^d)$  whenever  $\Omega \in L^q(\mathbb{S}^{md-1})$  with  $q > \frac{2m}{m+1}$ . Thus, in the multilinear case, boundedness on the product of  $L^2$  spaces and Hörmander's condition are not sufficient to yield the weak-type  $(1, 1, \dots, 1, 1/m)$  endpoint when  $d \leq 2$ .

## References

- [1] E. Buriánková, D. He, P. Honzík, Multilinear rough singular integrals, in preparation.
- [2] L. Chaffee, R.H. Torres, X. Wu, Multilinear weighted norm inequalities under integral type regularity conditions, in: S. Chanillo, et al. (Eds.), Harmonic Analysis, Partial Differential Equations and Applications, in: Applied and Numerical Harmonic Analysis, Birkhäuser/Springer, Cham, Switzerland, 2017, pp. 193–216.
- [3] R.R. Coifman, Y. Meyer, On commutators of singular integrals and bilinear singular integrals, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 212 (1975) 315–331.
- [4] R.R. Coifman, Y. Meyer, Commutateurs d' intégrales singulières et opérateurs multilinéaires, Ann. Inst. Fourier (Grenoble) 28 (1978) 177–202.
- [5] R.R. Coifman, Y. Meyer, Au-delà des opérateurs pseudo-différentiels, Astérisque, vol. 57, 1978.
- [6] G. Diestel, L. Grafakos, P. Honzík, Z. Si, E. Terwilleger, Method of rotations for bilinear singular integrals, Commun. Math. Anal. Commun. Math. Anal. Conf. 3 (2011) 99–107.
- [7] L. Grafakos, Modern Fourier Analysis, third edition, Graduate Texts in Mathematics, vol. 250, Springer, New York, 2014.
- [8] L. Grafakos, D. He, P. Honzík, Rough bilinear singular integrals, Adv. Math. 326 (2018) 54–78.
- [9] L. Grafakos, D. He, L. Slavíková,  $L^2 \times L^2 \rightarrow L^1$  boundedness criteria, Math. Ann. (2019), <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00208-018-1794-5>.
- [10] L. Grafakos, X. Li, Uniform bounds for the bilinear Hilbert transforms, I, Ann. of Math. (2) 159 (2004) 889–933.
- [11] L. Grafakos, R.H. Torres, Multilinear Calderón–Zygmund theory, Adv. Math. 165 (2002) 124–164.
- [12] L. Hörmander, Estimates for translation invariant operators in  $L^p$  spaces, Acta Math. 104 (1960) 93–140.
- [13] C.E. Kenig, E.M. Stein, Multilinear estimates and fractional integration, Math. Res. Lett. 6 (1999) 1–15.
- [14] X. Li, Uniform bounds for the bilinear Hilbert transform II, Rev. Mat. Iberoam. 22 (2006) 1069–1126.
- [15] K. Li, Sparse domination theorem for multilinear singular integral operators with  $L'$ -Hörmander condition, Michigan Math. J. 67 (2018) 253–265.
- [16] J.M. Martell, C. Pérez, R. Trujillo-González, Lack of natural weighted estimates for some singular integral operators, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 357 (2005) 385–396.
- [17] Y. Meyer, R. Coifman, Calderón–Zygmund and Multilinear Operators, translated from the 1990 and 1991 French originals by David Salinger, Cambridge Studies in Advanced Mathematics, vol. 48, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 1997.
- [18] C. Pérez, R.H. Torres, Minimal regularity conditions for the end-point estimate of bilinear Calderón–Zygmund operators, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. Ser. B 1 (2014) 1–13.